Global Issues in Immigration Law

Raquel Aldana
Pacific McGeorge School of Law

Won Kidane
Beth Lyon
Karla M. McKanders

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarlycommons.pacific.edu/facultyteaching

Part of the Comparative and Foreign Law Commons, Immigration Law Commons, and the International Law Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholarlycommons.pacific.edu/facultyteaching/26

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the McGeorge School of Law Faculty Scholarship at Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in McGeorge School of Law Teaching Materials by an authorized administrator of Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact mgibney@pacific.edu.
# Table of Contents

PREFACE .................................................................................................................... III
FOREWORD ................................................................................................................. V
TABLE OF CASES ......................................................................................................... XIX

Introduction. Immigration Law in an Era of Unprecedented Cross Border Mobility ................................................................. 1

## PART I. IMMIGRATION LAW IN A CHANGING TRANSNATIONAL CONTEXT

Chapter 1. Comparative and International Law: Sources and U.S. Approach .................................................................................. 9
A. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9
B. Influence of International and Comparative Law on U.S. Law ................................................................................................... 10
   Tipping the Balance: Why Courts Should Look to International and Foreign Law on Unauthorized Immigrant Worker Rights ................................................................. 14
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................................... 19

Chapter 2. Multilateral Regimes to Manage Migrations .............................................................................................................. 21
A. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 21
   1. World Migration Patterns .................................................................................. 22
   2. Historical Shifts of International Migration ..................................................... 22
   3. Irregular Migration ............................................................................................. 25
   4. Forced Migration ............................................................................................... 26
      Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 27
B. Regulating International Migration .................................................................... 28
   1. Global Migration Governance: An Introduction ............................................. 29
      Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 31
   2. Existing and Emerging Thematic Regimes of Global Migration ...................... 36
      a. Refugees ........................................................................................................ 36
         Excerpts From the Text of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of
         Refugees, Resolution 2198 (XXI) Adopted by the United Nations General
         Assembly ......................................................................................................... 38
         Notes and Questions ..................................................................................... 44


**b. Human Trafficking** ................................................................. 44
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 50

c. Irregular Migration ............................................................... 52
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 55
d. Trade Migration .................................................................. 55
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 56
e. Environmental Migration ...................................................... 59
f. International Travel .............................................................. 61
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 63

**C. Prescriptions for an International Migration Regime** ............. 64
   Making Cooperation Work: Interests, Incentives, and Action ............................................................................... 64
   New International Regime for Orderly Movements of People: What Will It Look Like? ............................................. 65
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 66

**D. Operationalizing an International Migration Regime** ............. 69
   Globalization, Sovereignty, and Transnational Regulation: Reshaping the Governance of International Migration ... 70
   Notes and Questions ............................................................... 73

**Chapter 3. Bilateral Cooperation on International Migration: The Case of Mexico–U.S. Migration** ............... 77

**A. Introduction** .......................................................................... 77

**B. The Origins of Mexican Migration to the United States** ......... 79
1. U.S. Bilateral Labor Agreements With Mexico ......................... 79
   a. The Bracero Program ......................................................... 79
      Notes and Questions ........................................................... 81
   b. Comparative Perspectives on Bilateral Labor Agreements ........................................................................ 83
   c. Best Practices in Bilateral Labor Agreements ................. 85
      Bilateral Temporary Labour Arrangements: Good Practices and Lessons Learnt .............................................. 85
      Notes and Questions ........................................................... 94
2. Maquilas and the Mexican Migrant Program ......................... 96
      Notes and Questions ........................................................... 97

**C. The North American Free Trade Agreement and Mexican Migration** ......................................................... 98

**Chapter Sixteen of NAFTA: Temporary Entry for Business Persons** ............................................................. 99
Notes and Questions ..................................................................................... 101
D. Security and Enforcement as the New Solution .................. 102
   Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 104

**PART II. COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES**

**Chapter 4. Mexico** .................................................................................. 109

A. Introduction ..................................................................................... 109
B. A History of International Migration to Mexico Since Mexican Independence ........................................ 109
   1. Defining the U.S.–Mexican Border ............................... 109
      Treaty of Peace, Friendship, Limits, and Settlement Between the United States of America and the United Mexican States .................................................... 110
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 113
   2. Mexico’s Migration After the New Border ..................... 114
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 116
C. Contemporary Lifestyle Migration to Mexico ..................... 119
   Run for the Border: Vice and Virtue in U.S.–Mexico Border Crossings .................................................................................... 121
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 122
D. Central Americans in Mexico ......................................................... 125
   1. The History of Central American Immigrants in Mexico ................................................................. 125
      Excerpts From the Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, Colloquium on the International Protection of Refugees in Central America, Mexico and Panama .................................................... 128
      The Mexican Constitution .......................................................... 130
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 131
   2. Central American Transmigrants Through Mexico ...... 132
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 134
E. A Paradigm Shift in Mexican Immigration Law? ............. 137
   Migratory Categories in Mexico: Analysis of the Migration Act ........................................................................ 137
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 145

**Chapter 5. Canada** .................................................................................. 147

A. Background ..................................................................................... 147
B. The Sources of Canadian Immigration Law ....................... 148
C. Canadian Citizenship ....................................................................... 149
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 151
D. Admission of Foreign Nationals .................................................. 151
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 153
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E. Grounds of Inadmissibility, Treatment and Removal</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Arrest, Detention and Release</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Forms of Relief From Removal</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 6. The European Union Immigration Regime</strong></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Background</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Identity and Immigration Policy in the U.S. and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the European Union</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. European Citizenship and Third-Country Nationals</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. European Union Citizenship</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Third-Country Nationals</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Admission and Treatment of Immigrants in the E.U.</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tensions at the Border in the U.S. and the E.U.: The Quest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for State Distinctiveness and Immigrant Inclusion</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Application of EU Law in Member States</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kunqian Catherine Zhu, Man Lavette Chen v. Secretary of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State for the Home Department</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 7. The United Kingdom</strong></td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Background</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Sources of UK Immigration Law</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Nationality/Citizenship</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Admission, Exclusion and Deportation</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 8. France</strong></td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Immigration Policies</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Assimilation for Naturalization: The “Headscarf Affair”</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and French <em>Laïcité</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Race Feminism Lifts the Veil?: Muslim Women,</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France and the Headscarf Ban</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Dimensions of West African Immigration to France</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Chapter 9. Spain: A “New Immigration Center”**

A. Introduction .......................................................... 235

B. Regularization in Spain ............................................. 237
   Spain: A “New Immigration Center” ............................. 237
   A New Immigration Regularization Policy: The Settlement
   Program in Spain ..................................................... 237
   What Nations Are Doing About Immigrant Workers in
   Downturn Economies: Examining and Comparing the
   Recent Treatment of Immigrant Workers in the
   United States and Spain .............................................. 238

C. Regularization in the United States ......................... 239

D. Policy in a Time of Economic Downturn: Spain’s Voluntary
   Return Program Versus the United States’ “Misery
   Strategy” .............................................................. 240
   Immigration Law Spanish–Style II: A Study of Spain’s
   Voluntary Immigrant Return Plan and Circular
   Migration ............................................................... 240
   Notes and Questions ................................................. 247

E. Labor Union and Contract Rights of Unauthorized
   Workers ........................................................................ 249
   Spain: A “New Immigration Center” ............................. 249
   Case Decision by La Sala de lo Social del Tribunal
   Superior de Justicia de Cataluña .................................... 250
   Case No. 2227 Report in Which the Committee Requests
   to Be Kept Informed of Developments ............................ 253
   Notes and Questions ................................................. 259

F. Protection of Human Life on Spain’s Southern Border ...... 259
   The Human Rights of Irregular Migrants in Europe .......... 260

G. Protection of Human Life on the United States’ Southern
   Border ........................................................................ 261
   Report No 78/08, Petition 478–05, Admissibility,
   Undocumented Migrant, Legal Resident, and U.S.
   Citizen Victims of Anti–Immigrant Vigilantes, United
   States, August 5, 2009 .................................................. 261
   Notes and Questions ................................................. 262

### PART III. HOT TOPICS IN UNITED STATES’ IMMIGRATION THROUGH A GLOBAL LENS

**Chapter 10. Freedom of Movement** ................................ 267

A. Introduction .................................................................. 267
   Questions and Notes ...................................................... 269
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**B. Limitations on Freedom of Movement: State Sovereignty and the Right to Exclude**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes and Questions .......................................................... 275

**C. Expansion on Freedom of Movement: A Right to Family Unification**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes and Questions .................................................................. 280

**D. A Right to Nationality** ...................................................... 280

**E. Examples of Stateless People** .......................................... 283

1. Case of the Girls Yean and Bosico v. Dominican Republic (children born to undocumented parents—right to jus soli) .......................................................... 284

Question ................................................................................. 287

Institute on Human Rights and Development in Africa v. Mauritania (ethnic minority discrimination) .................................................. 287

Roma (de facto and de jure statelessness) .................................. 289

Margita Cervenáková and Others v. The Czech Republic .... 292

Continued Discrimination in the Czech Republic .................. 293

Roma in Slovakia and Hungary .............................................. 293

Rohingya in Burma (religious and cultural minority) .......... 295

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 299

**Chapter 11. Living Conditions of Immigrants** ......................... 301

**A. Social Welfare: Public Benefits, Housing and Education** ..... 301


Public Benefits and Immigration: The Intersection of Immigration Status, Ethnicity, Gender, and Class ........................................................................................................ 302

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 307

2. Education ............................................................................. 308

3. Housing ................................................................................ 310

**B. Identification Requirements and Privacy** ............................ 312

**Chapter 12. Immigration Policing and Rights** ......................... 315

**A. Introduction** ...................................................................... 315

**B. Deportation Is Different** .................................................. 316

Deportation is Different ......................................................... 316

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 317

**C. The Crimmigration Crisis** .................................................. 321

The Crimmigration Crisis: Immigrants, Crime, and Sovereign Power ................................................................. 321

The Sonics of Crimmigration in Australia ................................ 325
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Imprisonment as a Mechanism of Immigration Control in Hong Kong</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Asymmetric Regimes</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Path of Immigration Law: Asymmetric Incorporation of Criminal Justice Norms</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. International Human Rights Norms to Reign in Immigration Enforcement</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. An Overview of International Responses to the Trend of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminalization of Migration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminalization of Migration in Europe: Human Rights and Implications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. More on the Rights of Immigrants in Detention</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arbitrary Detention in Australia: Detention of Unlawful Non–Citizens Under the Migration Act of 1958</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Comment 8: Right to Liberty and Security of Persons (Article 9)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A v. Australia</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment, Adopted by General Assembly Resolution 43/173 of 9 December 1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Due Process Rights of Immigrants in Removal Removal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceedings</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. The Padilla Revolution?</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Padilla v. Kentucky</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 13. Workplace Rights of Immigrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Consequences of an Unregulated Labor Market: Statements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Two Migrant Workers</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims’ Stories</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ending Abuses and Improving Conditions for Tomato Workers</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. International Migrant Worker Rights Law</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Standard–Setting: Lagging Ratification Shored up With Recent Interpretations</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Filling the Gap: Increase in Treaty Interpretations</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
a. Equal Protection for Unauthorized Workers .......... 376
   Inter-American Court of Human Rights Advisory
   Opinion OC–18/03 of September 17, 2003,
   Requested by the United Mexican States
   Legal Status and Rights of Undocumented
   Migrants ................................................................. 377
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 382
b. Visa Portability and Other Rights Specific to
   Migrant Workers...................................................... 383
   Notes and Questions.............................................. 387
c. Particularly Vulnerable Migrant Workers .......... 386
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 387

Chapter 14. Sovereignty and National Security:
Excluding and Deporting Terrorists in a
Comparative Context .............................................. 393
A. Who Is a Terrorist? .............................................. 393
   The Terrorism Bar to Asylum in Australia, Canada, the
   UK and the U.S......................................................... 393
   Notes and Questions............................................ 398
B. Excluding Terrorists ............................................. 398
   Notes and Questions............................................ 400
C. Deporting Terrorists ............................................. 401
   Notes and Questions............................................ 402
D. Judicial Opinions on Terrorism Related Cases—A
   Comparative Perspective ........................................... 402
   Suresh v. Canada .................................................. 409
   Cheema v. Ashcroft .............................................. 417
   Notes and Questions ............................................ 418

INDEX ........................................................................ 419