Global Issues in Immigration Law

Raquel Aldana
Pacific McGeorge School of Law

Won Kidane

Beth Lyon

Karla M. McKanders
# Table of Contents

PREFACE ........................................................................................................ III

FOREWORD ............................................................................................... V

TABLE OF CASES ........................................................................................ XIX

Introduction. Immigration Law in an Era of Unprecedented Cross Border Mobility ........................................... 1

## PART I. IMMIGRATION LAW IN A CHANGING TRANSNATIONAL CONTEXT

### Chapter 1. Comparative and International Law: Sources and U.S. Approach ................................................................. 9

A. Introduction ........................................................................................... 9

B. Influence of International and Comparative Law on U.S. Law .................................................................................. 10

   Tipping the Balance: Why Courts Should Look to International and Foreign Law on Unauthorized Immigrant Worker Rights ............................................................................. 14

   Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 19

### Chapter 2. Multilateral Regimes to Manage Migrations ................................................................................................. 21

A. Introduction ........................................................................................... 21

   1. World Migration Patterns ................................................................ 22

   2. Historical Shifts of International Migration .................................... 22

   3. Irregular Migration .......................................................................... 25

   4. Forced Migration ............................................................................ 26

   Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 27

B. Regulating International Migration ....................................................... 28

   1. Global Migration Governance: An Introduction ......................... 29

   Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 31

   2. Existing and Emerging Thematic Regimes of Global Migration ................................................................................. 36

      a. Refugees ....................................................................................... 36

      Excerpts From the Text of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, Resolution 2198 (XXI) Adopted by the United Nations General Assembly ................................................................................. 38

      Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 44
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b. Human Trafficking</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excerpts From the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime [The Palermo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol]</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Irregular Migration</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Trade Migration</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Environmental Migration</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. International Travel</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Prescriptions for an International Migration Regime</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Cooperation Work: Interests, Incentives, and Action</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New International Regime for Orderly Movements of People: What Will It</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Look Like?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Operationalizing an International Migration Regime</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globalization, Sovereignty, and Transnational Regulation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reshaping the Governance of International Migration</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3. Bilateral Cooperation on International Migration: The Case</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of Mexico–U.S. Migration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Origins of Mexican Migration to the United States</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. U.S. Bilateral Labor Agreements With Mexico</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The Bracero Program</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Comparative Perspectives on Bilateral Labor Agreements</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Best Practices in Bilateral Labor Agreements</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilateral Temporary Labour Arrangements: Good Practices and Lessons</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learnt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Maquilas and the Mexican Migrant Program</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The North American Free Trade Agreement and Mexican Migration</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Sixteen of NAFTA: Temporary Entry for Business Persons</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes and Questions.................................................................................. 101

D. Security and Enforcement as the New Solution.......................... 102
   Notes and Questions........................................................................... 104

**PART II. COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES**

**Chapter 4. Mexico** .............................................................................. 109

A. Introduction ......................................................................................... 109

B. A History of International Migration to Mexico Since
   Mexican Independence ........................................................................ 109
   1. Defining the U.S.–Mexican Border ............................................. 109
      Treaty of Peace, Friendship, Limits, and Settlement
      Between the United States of America and the
      United Mexican States .................................................................. 110
      Notes and Questions ..................................................................... 113
   2. Mexico’s Migration After the New Border .............................. 114
      Notes and Questions ..................................................................... 116

C. Contemporary Lifestyle Migration to Mexico ............................. 119
   Run for the Border: Vice and Virtue in U.S.–Mexico Border
   Crossings ......................................................................................... 121
   Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 122

D. Central Americans in Mexico ............................................................. 125
   1. The History of Central American Immigrants in
      Mexico ....................................................................................... 125
      Excerpts From the Cartagena Declaration on Refugees,
      Colloquium on the International Protection of
      Refugees in Central America, Mexico and
      Panama ....................................................................................... 128
      The Mexican Constitution ......................................................... 130
      Notes and Questions ..................................................................... 131
   2. Central American Transmigrants Through Mexico ............. 132
      Notes and Questions ..................................................................... 134

E. A Paradigm Shift in Mexican Immigration Law? ...................... 137
   Migratory Categories in Mexico: Analysis of the Migration
   Act ..................................................................................................... 137
   Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 145

**Chapter 5. Canada** .............................................................................. 147

A. Background ......................................................................................... 147

B. The Sources of Canadian Immigration Law ............................... 148

C. Canadian Citizenship ......................................................................... 149
   Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 151

D. Admission of Foreign Nationals ..................................................... 151
   Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 153
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Grounds of Inadmissibility, Treatment and Removal</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Arrest, Detention and Release</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>Forms of Relief From Removal</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 6. The European Union Immigration Regime</strong></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National Identity and Immigration Policy in the U.S. and the European Union</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>European Citizenship and Third–Country Nationals</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>European Union Citizenship</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Third–Country Nationals</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Admission and Treatment of Immigrants in the E.U.</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tensions at the Border in the U.S. and the E.U. The Quest for State Distinctiveness and Immigrant Inclusion</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>The Application of EU Law in Member States</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kunqian Catherine Zhu, Man Lavette Chen v. Secretary of State for the Home Department</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 7. The United Kingdom</strong></td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>The Sources of UK Immigration Law</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Nationality/Citizenship</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Admission, Exclusion and Deportation</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 8. France</strong></td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Immigration Policies</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Assimilation for Naturalization: The “Headscarf Affair” and French Laïcité</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Critical Race Feminism Lifts the Veil: Muslim Women, France and the Headscarf Ban</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Dimensions of West African Immigration to France</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Chapter 9. Spain: A “New Immigration Center”** .................................. 235  
A. Introduction ....................................................................................... 235  
B. Regularization in Spain ..................................................................... 237  
Spain: A “New Immigration Center” .................................................. 237  
   A New Immigration Regularization Policy: The Settlement  
       Program in Spain ........................................................................... 237  
What Nations Are Doing About Immigrant Workers in  
       Downturn Economies: Examining and Comparing the  
       Recent Treatment of Immigrant Workers in the  
       United States and Spain ................................................................. 238  
C. Regularization in the United States ................................................. 239  
D. Policy in a Time of Economic Downturn: Spain’s Voluntary  
       Return Program Versus the United States’ “Misery  
       Strategy” ..................................................................................... 240  
   Immigration Law Spanish–Style II: A Study of Spain’s  
       Voluntary Immigrant Return Plan and Circular  
       Migration ....................................................................................... 240  
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 247  
E. Labor Union and Contract Rights of Unauthorized  
       Workers .......................................................................................... 249  
Spain: A “New Immigration Center” .................................................. 249  
   Case Decision by La Sala de lo Social del Tribunal  
       Superior de Justicia de Cataluña ..................................................... 250  
   Case No. 2227 Report in Which the Committee Requests  
       to Be Kept Informed of Developments ....................................... 253  
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 259  
F. Protection of Human Life on Spain’s Southern Border ................. 259  
   The Human Rights of Irregular Migrants in Europe ..................... 260  
G. Protection of Human Life on the United States’ Southern  
       Border ............................................................................................ 261  
   Report No 78/08, Petition 478–05, Admissibility,  
       Undocumented Migrant, Legal Resident, and U.S.  
       Citizen Victims of Anti–Immigrant Vigilantes, United  
       States, August 5, 2009 ................................................................. 261  
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 262  

**PART III. HOT TOPICS IN UNITED STATES’ IMMIGRATION THROUGH A GLOBAL LENS**

**Chapter 10. Freedom of Movement** ............................................... 267  
A. Introduction ....................................................................................... 267  
Questions and Notes ........................................................................... 269
B. Limitations on Freedom of Movement: State Sovereignty and the Right to Exclude ................................................. 270
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 275
C. Expansion on Freedom of Movement: A Right to Family Unification .......................................................... 277
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 280
D. A Right to Nationality .................................................................. 280
E. Examples of Stateless People ......................................................... 283
   1. Case of the Girls Yeán and Bosico v. Dominican Republic (children born to undocumented parents—right to jus soli) .................................................................................. 284
      Question ...................................................................................... 287
Institute on Human Rights and Development in Africa v. Mauritania (ethnic minority discrimination) .................................................. 287
Roma (de facto and de jure statelessness) ........................................ 289
Margita Cervenáková and Others v. The Czech Republic ....... 292
Continued Discrimination in the Czech Republic ................. 293
Roma in Slovakia and Hungary ..................................................... 293
Rohingya in Burma (religious and cultural minority) .......... 295
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 299

Chapter 11. Living Conditions of Immigrants .................. 301
A. Social Welfare: Public Benefits, Housing and Education ...... 301
   1. Comparison Between International Principles and Social and Economic Benefits in the United States ...... 302
      Public Benefits and Immigration: The Intersection of Immigration Status, Ethnicity, Gender, and Class .................................................................................. 302
      Notes and Questions ...................................................................... 307
   2. Education .................................................................................... 308
   3. Housing ....................................................................................... 310
B. Identification Requirements and Privacy .......................... 312
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 313

Chapter 12. Immigration Policing and Rights .................. 315
A. Introduction .................................................................................. 315
B. Deportation Is Different .............................................................. 316
   Deportation is Different .................................................................. 316
   Notes and Questions ...................................................................... 317
C. The Crimmigration Crisis ........................................................... 321
   The Crimmigration Crisis: Immigrants, Crime, and Sovereign Power .......................................................... 321
   The Sonics of Crimmigration in Australia ................................... 325
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Women’s Imprisonment as a Mechanism of Immigration Control in Hong Kong .................................................. 326
Notes and Questions .......................................................... 327

D. The Asymmetric Regimes .............................................. 329
The New Path of Immigration Law: Asymmetric Incorporation of Criminal Justice Norms .......................... 330
Notes and Questions .......................................................... 331

E. International Human Rights Norms to Reign in Immigration Enforcement ...................................................... 335
1. An Overview of International Responses to the Trend of Criminalization of Migration ............................... 336
   Criminalization of Migration in Europe: Human Rights and Implications ...................................................... 336
2. More on the Rights of Immigrants in Detention .......... 340
   Arbitrary Detention in Australia: Detention of Unlawful Non-Citizens Under the Migration Act of 1958 ........ 340
   General Comment 8: Right to Liberty and Security of Persons (Article 9) ...................................................... 344
   A v. Australia .................................................................. 345
   Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons Under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment, Adopted by General Assembly Resolution 43/173 of 9 December 1988 ............................................. 350
   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 353
3. The Due Process Rights of Immigrants in Removal Proceedings ................................................................. 358
   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 360

F. The Padilla Revolution? ................................................. 362
   Padilla v. Kentucky .......................................................... 363
   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 366

Chapter 13. Workplace Rights of Immigrants ........................ 369
A. Introduction ..................................................................... 369
B. Consequences of an Unregulated Labor Market: Statements From Two Migrant Workers .................................... 371
   Victims’ Stories ................................................................. 371
   Ending Abuses and Improving Conditions for Tomato Workers .................................................................. 372
C. International Migrant Worker Rights Law ...................... 373
   1. Standard–Setting: Lagging Ratification Shored up With Recent Interpretations ............................................. 373
   2. Filling the Gap: Increase in Treaty Interpretations Protecting Migrant Workers ........................................ 376
a. Equal Protection for Unauthorized Workers ........ 376
   Inter–American Court of Human Rights Advisory
   Opinion OC–18/03 of September 17, 2003,
   Requested by the United Mexican States
   Legal Status and Rights of Undocumented
   Migrants ............................................................. 377
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 382
b. Visa Portability and Other Rights Specific to
   Migrant Workers................................................ 383
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 387
c. Particularly Vulnerable Migrant Workers .......... 386
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 387

Chapter 14. Sovereignty and National Security:
Excluding and Deporting Terrorists in a
Comparative Context ............................................ 393
A. Who Is a Terrorist? ............................................ 393
   The Terrorism Bar to Asylum in Australia, Canada, the
   UK and the U.S.................................................... 393
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 398
B. Excluding Terrorists ........................................... 398
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 400
C. Deporting Terrorists ........................................... 401
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 402
D. Judicial Opinions on Terrorism Related Cases—A
   Comparative Perspective ................................. 402
   Suresh v. Canada ............................................. 409
   Cheema v. Ashcroft ......................................... 417
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 418

INDEX ...................................................................... 419